



Technical Committee 184: Industrial automation systems and integration
Subcommittee 4: Industrial data

TC 184/SC4 N929

1999-09-15

ISO TC 184/SC4 Report of Ballot Results for
ISO/DIS 10303-0034

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

The ISO TC 184/SC4 secretariat is pleased to announce that ISO/DIS 10303-0034 was approved. The following table summarizes the ballot results for this project. The official detailed results of voting report has been distributed to P-members by the ISO central secretariat. A copy of the ISO results of voting report is also being sent by the SC4 secretariat to the SC4 project leader of this document for review.

| COUNTRY | VOTE | COMMENTS |
|--------------------|------|----------|
| Australia (P) | Y | |
| Belgium (O) | Y | |
| Brazil (O) | Y | |
| Canada (P) | | |
| China (P) | Y | |
| Czech Republic (O) | Y | |
| France (P) | Y | |
| Germany (P) | A | |
| India (O) | A | |
| Italy (P) | Y | |
| Japan (P) | Y | |
| Korea, Rep. Of (P) | Y | |
| Netherlands (P) | A | |
| Norway (P) | Y | |
| Poland (O) | Y | |
| Portugal (P) | Y | |
| Romania (O) | Y | |
| Russia (P) | Y | |
| Spain (P) | Y | |
| Sweden (P) | Y | |
| Switzerland (P) | A | |
| United Kingdom (P) | N | Attached |
| United States (P) | Y | |

| | |
|----------------------|----|
| P-members in favor | 12 |
| P-members abstaining | 3 |
| members against | 1 |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| P-members late voting | 0 |
| P-members not voting | 1 |

*This report is based on the ISO table of replies on the result of voting for ISO/DIS 10303-0034 dated 1999-06-03. This report is for informative purposes only and does not constitute the official results of the voting. These results are available at the following URL: http://www.nist.gov/sc4/step/parts/part034/current/bal_cmt

Address reply to:
ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Building 220, Room A127
Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA
Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

Address reply to:
ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Building 220, Room A127
Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA
Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

Ballot Comments

NOTE:

Some of these comment may have been scanned using Optical Character Recognition and have not been verified as 100% accurate. Please refer to the original hard copy in cases of irregularities.

United Kingdom

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

1. INTRODUCTION

This document presents the UK vote, comments and recommendations on ISO/DIS 10303-34

2. VOTING RESPONSE

The UK votes DISAPPROVAL of ISO/DIS 10303-34 with the Technical comments in Section 3, and the Editorial comments in Section 4.

3. TECHNICAL COMMENTS

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34.1

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: I

CLASSIFICATION- Major Technical

DESCRIPTION-

The scope statement refers to "STEP (sic) instance models". This term is not defined anywhere. This is more than an editorial issue (adding the definition) as there are significant technical implications related to the assumed implementation architecture of ISO 10303. The definition of "instance model" given in 3.4.2 is not sufficient (see separate issue)-

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

All WGs involved in the development of ISO 10303 should consider this issue, together with representatives of end-user and implementor communities. Resolution of this issue could result in a proposed NWI for a standard or technical specification that explicitly describes the implementation architecture of ISO 10303, and fully explains terms like "STEP instance model".

..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-2

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

CLAUSE: 5.3,6.2

CLASSIFICATION: Major Technical

DESCRIPTION:

None of the analyses described in these subclauses take into account the population constraints expressed in an AP through the mapping table reference path and mapping rules.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

Add appropriate analysis stage(s) that check whether relevant mapping table constraints have been satisfied in the exchange structure.

.... .. .

\\chnwb\.%hue\dept\disc\local\amt\amt4\pr@_step\comnicnt@,\034-dis\034-dis.doc Page 1 of 17

S@ : 0 1 'TVA '8 1 NOI@, '-.3@dAl, @ i@nih 0 1 'TVA '9 1 NOlid33@@ 30 3@nJH

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISOIDIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-3

AUTHOR- Jon Owen

CLAUSE: page 1, bullets 3 and 4-.

CLASSIFICATION: Major Technical

DESCRIPTION:

These conflict with the last paragraph. It is unclear what sort of SDAI implementations are in the scope of this part, particularly given the existence of part 35. The earlier (standardised) parts in the 30-series require and describe one abstract test method for each implementation method (34 with 21: 35 with 22). If SDAI implementations happen (quite sensibly) to use the SDAI as a means of accessing internal data structures but receive and produce STEP physical files, then it is the contents of the physical file that are measured against the internal structures - and not the method of accessing structures (which requires a different method of testing, as given in part 35). This issue was raised (by Jan van Maanen) in the previous ballot, I have not seen a resolution to it.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-4

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.1, page 7, para 3, last line:

| |
|---|
| Address reply to: ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat National Institute of Standards and Technology Building 220, Room A127 Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - http://www.nist.gov/sc4/ |
|---|

CLASSIFICATION: Major Technical

DESCRIPTION:

What is such output, unless a STEP physical file or populated internal data structures? This is unclear. If a physical file or populated internal data structures are meant, then include these words specifically. This would also help to resolve major technical issue UK- 1 0303-34-3, if this assumption is correct. If the assumption is not correct, then such 'output' needs to be clarified, and an example included.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

1..1,I,,11 11 1. 1.@...,

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-6

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.2, example-

CLASSIFICATION: Major Technical

DESCRIPTION:

This is good, but needs to be extended so that the onus is on the application protocol authors to make these explicit, many APs include informal propositions, but are they intended to be tested as a matter of course?

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

\\chnwb\share\dcpt@disc\local\aznt\amt4\pr@_swp\corruncnts\034-dis\034-dis.doc
of 17

Page 2

0 1 T V @ ' 8 3 @ n 3 H 0 1 T V A ' 8 1 N O I d 3 O @ @ 10 3 @ n 3 H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34
Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-6

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3, page 12, para 2:

CLASSIFICATION: Major Technical

DESCRIPTION:

Mathematical precision is not the same as numerical accuracy

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-7

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.5, last para:

CLASSIFICATION: Major Technical

DESCRIPTION:

| |
|---|
| Address reply to: ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat National Institute of Standards and Technology Building 220, Room A127 Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - http://www.nist.gov/sc4/ |
|---|

Delete 'furthe@, because STEP-32 is the main source of information about the conformance test report- [this is an editorial comment, but is not minor]

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-8

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: page x, para 3:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

'share information with' is unclear; at least change to 'using', but preferably reword (see also major technical issue UK-10303-34-3)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

@.: 1. . .1@, 1. @. . @ .7":", . 1.@. .1@.. .1, I

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-9

AUTHOR- Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.1 para 1 -

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

\\chnwb\share\dcpt\disc\locat\amt\arnt4\pr@.step\commenU\034-dis\034-dis.doc Page 3 of 17

\$0 1T VN '9 @NO II @ dN I 0 1 I VN '9 1NOlid3)@@ 3C 3@n]H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

Introduces three principal components and then explains only two.- at least refer back to STEP-31 for IUT

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-10

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.2.2:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

test campaign is defined in -31 and should be reproduced or referenced

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

1.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-11

AUTHOR-. Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.2.3

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

includes material that is in 5.4, so delete from here

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-12

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4-2.3, para 2:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

need to define 'ISO problem resolution parties' (there is a placeholder in -31)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

. -1@-..@

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-13

AUTHOR-. Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.2.4-.

CLASSIFICATION-- Minor Technical

\\chnwb\sh=\dept\disc\local\nmt\axnt4\p@_stcp\comments\034-dis\034-dis.dc)c Page 4 of 17

S@:01

TVA91 NOlidjO@@ ia i@n]H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISOIDIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

DESCRIPTION:

delete 'or logs': there is one conformance log for each conformance test report

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-14

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- 5.2-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION-

incorrect use of 'shall'. The IUT will only generate such output if it is a conforming implementation, which is presumably being determined by the testing itself.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-15

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3 last line.-

CLASSIFICATION- Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

this appears in 5.4 and so should be deleted from 5.3

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-.

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-16

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.3, para 1:

CLASSIFICATION- Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

delete extra carriage return and blank line

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-17

AUTHOR- Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.3, para I-

\\chnwb\share\dcpt\disc\local\amt\amt4\pr_step\cnmmcnLs\034-dis\034-dis.doc Page 5@ of 17

T VN '8 1

3@n3H

0 1 T VA '8 1 NOlid3@@@ 3@ 3@03H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

divide last sentence into at least two sentences

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982

Telefax: +1-301-975-4694

Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov

url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

... ..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-18

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.4, last para-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

change to 'indicates nonconformance', deleting references to proof (which cannot be indicated') and the valid test process (which is irrelevant)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.. I I", " ,.....-....., II-@... I.I. @, " ..., I,..... .1,111-....." -" .. @.111'....., . I.,. @ ..". @, 1.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-19

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 6.2, sentence 3-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

change 'can be' to 'are' (it is factual)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-20

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE, 6.2, last line.

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:

end sentence after 'further analysis' (this material is in 5.4)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-21

AUTHOR-. Jon Owen

\\chnwb\share\dept\disc\local\amt\amt4\pr@.step\comments\034-di.s\034-dis.doc
17

Page 6 of

Address reply to:
ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Building 220, Room A127
Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA
Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34
Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods
CLAUSE: 6.2.1 -.
CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION:

incorrect use of 'shall' again

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-22

AUTHOR: Jon Owen
CLAUSE: 6.2- 1, page 14, line 1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION:

unhappy juxtaposition of 'specific' and 'specified':
PROPOSED RESOLUTION:
change to'---based on requirements specified or referenced-.-'
... .. I@11,1@; 1-11 I
ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-23

AUTHOR: Jon Owen
CLAUSE- 6.2.1, page 14, last line,
CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION:
incorrect use of 'should':
PROPOSED RESOLUTION-
change to'... an error shall be documented in the test report'.
"I@

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-24

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler
CLAUSE: 1
CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical
DESCRIPTION:
An implementation of ISO 10303 for product data exchange combines an application protocol and an implementation method. The scope statement makes it appear that the choice of implementation method is a constraint on the testability.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

\\chn-b\Sharc\dcpt\disc\local\amtkamt4\pr@_!iitp\conunents\034-di.-@034-dis.doc

Page 7 of 17

TV@'81 Nolid3D@@ 3a 3@A3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Reword the scope statement so that the first sentence becomes ISO 10303 application protocol (AP) combined with an ISO 10303 implementation method."

..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-25

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: 3.4.2

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Technical

DESCRIPTION:-

This definition is incomprehensible!

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

Please provide a definition that actually conveys the intended meaning of this term accurately.

4. EDITORIAL COMMENTS

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-26

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: Foreword

CLASSIFICATION: Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

The list of parts of ISO 10303 is out of date (no APs 232, no Part 107, PROPOSED RESOLUTION:
Update the list, or make use of the convention adopted in the second edition IR parts to refer to the list via a URL.

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-27

AUTHOR.- Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: Introduction

CLASSIFICATION- Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

The second paragraph uses out-of-date boilerplate text,

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

Update as per SC54 N537, including reference to application interpreted constructs.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-28

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

0 1 T V N '8 1

3@n3H

0 1 T V N '8 1 NOlid3)@@ 30 3@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

AUTHOR:- Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: Foreword, I

CLASSIFICATION: Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

What is this "STEP" thing that is refer-red to?

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

Change all references to "ISO 10303" or "this International Standard".

.. .. ".: .., .., " @. @, , , . @ , ". " 11"....,-, .1

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-29

AUTHOR:- Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: 2

CLASSIFICATION: Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

The "to be published" footnote for ISO 10303-33 is missing.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

Add the footnote.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-30

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: 4

CLASSIFICATION: Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

Second paragraph- is the reference to "ISO 10303-3xx" intended to be ISO 10303-33?

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

Correct this reference,

I'll @.: @, @'ll;@, , , , , I L.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-31

AUTHOR, Julian Fowler

CLAUSE. Figures 1 and 2

CLASSIFICATION: Editorial

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

DESCRIPTION:

The fonts used in these diagrams do not satisfy the requirements of the Supplementary Directives.

Page 9 of 17

\\chnwb\share\dcpt\disc\local\mnt\amt4\pr@_.,;tcp\commetits\034-dis\034-dis.doc

3@n3H @@:01 TVAS@ NOId33@@ la]@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

Font should be the same as that used for text in the document (Times, Times New Roman). Font size should be in the range 8-1 Opt- In addition, figure 1 should be moved so that immediately follows the text that refers to it (before the heading for 5-1)-

..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-32

AUTHOR: Julian Fowler

CLAUSE: Annex A

CLASSIFICATION.- Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

The use of O' version numbers in ASN.1 identification of DIS parts is deprecated.

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

Change the version number to 1. Add a NOTE stating that this is the identifier that will apply to the final IS version.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-33

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: page ix:

CLASSIFICATION- Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

part 13 no longer exists and so the range for the description methods should be amended PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-34

| |
|---|
| Address reply to: ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat National Institute of Standards and Technology Building 220, Room A127 Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - http://www.nist.gov/sc4/ |
|---|

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: page ix--

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

should parts 232 and 332 be added to the ranges (and the preceding list of parts)?

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-35

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- page ix:

\\chnwb\sharc\dcpt\di-;c\local\amt\amt4\pr@_stcp\comments\034-di5\034-dis.dt)c
17

Page 1 0 of

IVA 61

0 @T VA '8 1NOlid3)@@ 3C 3@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

is part 518 the highest-numbered AIC?

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

...

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-36

AUTHOR-. Jon Owen

CLAUSE- page x, para 2-.

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

the class of AICs is missing

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

... ..

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-37

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: page numbering-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

should be Roman up to the first occurrence of page 10

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-38

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: clause 2-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION.-

part 33 footnote is missing

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.. .. . -----

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-39

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 3.3,

\\chnwb\share\dcpt\disc\local\amt\arnt4\pUlep\conimnts\034-dis\O34-dis.doc Page 1 1 of 17

01.-JUN.@99(WED) 14:43 BSI DISC
002

TEL:0181 996 7448

P.

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework : Abstract test meth

r ds

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editodal

DESCRIPTION:

implementation under test should have its abbreviation added

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-40

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE.- 3.3:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

the three verdicts should not be in upper case (this needs to be rectified throughout the document)
PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-41

AUTHOR- Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 3.3-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

system under test abbreviation is missing

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

I'll I" ...,...-.....-,

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-42

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 3.4.1:

CLASSIFICATION- Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

this definition should appear in part 1 (or all of the application protocols); alternatively use application object and application assertion when the current term appears (which is not often)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-43

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

\\chnwb\!\.hamkdcpt\disc\local\Ami\amt4\pr@_step\comment5\034-dis\034-dis.doc
17

Page 12 of

0 1TVA '8 1 3@n] H 0 1T VA 'VQ INOlid3@@@ 30 3@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework : Abstract test methods

CLAUSE: 3-4.2-

| |
|---|
| Address reply to: ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat National Institute of Standards and Technology Building 220, Room A127 Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - http://www.nist.gov/sc4/ |
|---|

CLASSIFICATION-. Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

information elements are not defined-. are they the same as application elements?

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-"

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- 3-4.3:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

IUT is superfluous, so delete it

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.... ..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-45

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 3.4.6-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

this seems to be carefully worded but can (I think) be simplified to'... IUT instance model conforms to an implementation method..-'

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-46

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- 3-4.7-.

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

difference to conformance log (defined in -31) is not clear (also note the definition of conformance test report)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

..... ..

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-47

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

0 1 TVA '8 TVA '9 1 NOlid]3@ @ 3C 3@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 3.5-.

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

delete AE (hardly used, if at all)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

..... .

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-48

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 3.5:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

delete TS for similar reasons

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-49

AUTHOR-- Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.1, page 7, para 3:

CLASSIFICATION-- Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION-

'e.g.' is not ISO style

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-50

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- 4-2.1, page 7, last line:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

'test process interfaces' is undefined and unclear

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

::: 11.1 "IL..."@-"., 1, .1@'....",', I,... I I...".....@.I@,, "I
N\chnwb\shwt\dept\disc\locEd\umi\amt4\p@_stcp\coffLments\034-dis\034-
<lis.doc

Page 14 of 17

0 @ TVA '9 1 3@n]H 0 1 T VA '8 1NOlid3D@@ 3a 3@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO/DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-51

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.2.2, para 2, sentence I

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

use an enumeration to show the steps

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.....

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-52

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- 4.2.2, para 2, sentence 2-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION-

change to: 'These steps are different for...'

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-53

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 4.2-2, para 3:

CLASSIFICATION. Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

change SC4 to ISO TC 1 84/SC4 (there are many SC4s)

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:-

"I".....@."

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-54

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

incorrect reference to 5.5

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

I I @ 1. @. @

\\chnwb\share\dc t@disc\local\anit\amt4\p@_step\commcnts\034-dis\034-dis.doc Page 15 of 17

@@:O@ TVN'81 NOI'-V"-U@3@dNI,a]@n]H @@:O@ TVN'8@ NOlidl)@@ 3a]@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISO DIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-66

AUTHOR-. Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.2, para 2 and 3:

CLASSIFICATION- Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION-.

'(see example N)'is not ISO style

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-56

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

AUTHOR- Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.2, para 3:

CLASSIFICATION- Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

change to 'are considered to be errors'

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

.I- I .. --." 1. @., ,

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-67

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.3, para 2 and 3:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION-.

'(see example N)' is not ISO style

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-.

.1.1-1.@..." -11.11'.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-58

AUTHOR., Jon Owen

CLAUSE: 5.3.3, example 2-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

non-planar would be a better example: it is more likely that such a surface would be degenerated into a series of planar facets

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

C:\cal\arnt\t4\ r stc mments\0.34-dis\034-dis.doc

Page 16 of 17

@ @:01 TVN'81 NOLid33@ @ IC 3@n3H

BALLOT RESPONSE AND UK COMMENTS ON ISODIS 10303-34

Conformance testing methodology and framework: Abstract test methods

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-59

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE- 5.4 para 3:

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

'(see example)' is not ISO style

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-60

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: figures.-

CLASSIFICATION: Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

Remove abbreviations for Test Engine and Test System, these appear to be their only occurrences

PROPOSED RESOLUTION:

.

ISSUE NUMBER UK-10303-34-61

AUTHOR: Jon Owen

CLAUSE: index:

CLASSIFICATION-. Minor Editorial

DESCRIPTION:

not very useful (for example: what is the significance of the difference between abstract test case and abstract test cases?), and it also includes references to definitions

PROPOSED RESOLUTION-

Address reply to:

ISO TC 184/SC4 Secretariat

National Institute of Standards and Technology

Building 220, Room A127

Gaithersburg, MD 20899 USA

Phone: +1-301-975-3982 Telefax: +1-301-975-4694 Email: sc4sec@cme.nist.gov url - <http://www.nist.gov/sc4/>